

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

August 09, 2011

Approved 09/13/2011

Page 1 of 6

---

## Call Meeting To Order

Vice Chairman Bryan Green called the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission (HARC) Meeting of August 09, 2011 to order at **3:00 pm** at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510 Greene Street, Key West.

## Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

## Roll Call

Commissioners present include Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, and Vice Chairman Bryan Green.

Commissioners Daniel Metzler, and Chairman Rudy Molinet were absent with consent.

Also present from city staff; Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, Chief Building Official John Woodson, IT Director Patti McLaughlin, and Recording Secretaries Jo Bennett and Diane Nicklaus.

## Approval of Agenda

Vice Chairman Bryan Green inquired if there were any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa stated that there was a request to move item #5 first, item #8 applicant requested to postpone, item #12 was Staff Approved as a result of changes to the plans and #13 the applicant requested to postponed. Vice Chairman Bryan Green stated item #9 should be postponed due to lack of quorum since it is a project by Commissioner Carlos Rojas.

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the Agenda changes be **Approved**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

## Approval of Minutes

### 1 July 12, 2011

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the Minutes be **Passed**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

### 2 July 26, 2011

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Nils Muench, that the Minutes be passed as amended reflecting Mr. Rojas' had an excused absence. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous vote.

## Old Business

### 5 Demolition of back portion and detached metal garage #1016 James Street – Michael Miller (H11-01-872) – Second reading

Michael Miller presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

A motion was made by Mr. Muench, seconded by Mr. Rojas, that the second reading of the Item be **Approved**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Chairman Molinet, and Mr. Metzler

Yes: 3 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, and Mr. Rojas

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

August 09, 2011

Approved 09/13/2011

Page 2 of 6

---

**4a** Addition at rear -  
**#617 Mickens Lane – Michael Skoglund (H11-01-855)**

Michael Skoglund presented the project. Mr. Skoglund stated that during a previous meeting the Commissioners asked the project be scaled down which they have done in the new plans.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. The structure is listed as a contributing resource in the survey. Stating Guidelines for Additions, Alterations and New Construction (pages 36-38) particularly Guidelines #1, #2, #3, #4, #5, #6, and #7 which can be reviewed. Staff understands mass and the scale of this new structure will have an adverse effect on the contributing building and staff understands that the application and design is not in compliance with the Guidelines.

Commissioners discussed the application.

At their request, Michael Skoglund reviewed the plans with the Commissioners.

Commissioners requested additional information - current pictures of the site as well as existing drawings of the site.

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

**4b** Demolition of back shed -  
**#617 Mickens Lane – Michael Skoglund (H11-01-855) – First reading**

Michael Skoglund presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Stating shed is non-historic and the Commission could consider this first reading of this request.

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

**3** Two story addition on rear. New hip roof to replace existing gable one and new additions to existing second floor porches.  
**#1107 Grinnell Street- Adele V. Stones (H11-01-445)**  
**upon remand by the Special Magistrate**

**Discussion of clarification questions presented by Special Magistrate.**

- Was the initial vote to deny based solely on the belief that the building is historic in nature? Yes or No?
- If the vote was not based on the belief the building was historic then why was the application denied.
  - Mr. Muench – **No (Mr. Muench made the Denial motion.)**  
Mr. Muench made the motion to deny based on the fact the Guidelines for Additions, Alterations and New Construction specifically addressed on page

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

August 09, 2011

Approved 09/13/2011

Page 3 of 6

---

36 of our HARC Guidelines and had no relation to Historic or not. Mr. Muench cited paragraph #1, #2, #3 in his motion, stating that the mass and the scale of this new structure will have an adverse effect on the building and the surrounding area.

- o Mr. Rojas – **Yes**
- o Mr. Green – **No (seconded the motion)**

Mr. Green seconded the motion to deny based on the fact that the mass and the scale of this new structure will have an adverse effect on the building and the surrounding area.

- 6** Remove existing second story roof deck, rails, and fence and add back gable roof that was previously removed.

**Code Compliance Case - #2 Scheppens Lane – William Horn (H11-01-804)**

William Horn presenting the project on behalf of the owner requested the item be **Postponed** until they are able to obtain the all the additional information necessary to present the project.

A motion was made by Mr. Rojas, seconded by Mr. Muench, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Chairman Molinet, and Mr. Metzler

Yes: 3 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, and Mr. Rojas

- 7** Remove existing seven front columns and replace.

**#1420 White Street – Infinity Builders (H11-01-929)**

Mitch Sammis of Infinity Builders presented the project. It has been determined the columns are not usable – there is not enough left of the existing columns to salvage. The Mr. Sammis presented new drawings proposed as alternative methods to use to replace the existing columns.

At the Commissioners' request, Mr. Sammis reviewed the new drawings with the Commissioners.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Stating staff understands that the existing columns need to be replaced due to state of deterioration.

The Commissions requested pictures and additional supporting information to show the total decay of the columns.

No public comment.

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Nils Muench, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Chairman Molinet, and Mr. Metzler

Yes: 3 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, and Mr. Rojas

- 8** Add third story roof to existing third floor deck, extend floor porch floor over second floor porch and add a small spa.

**#817 Eaton Street – William Horn (H11-01-936)**

**Postponed**

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

August 09, 2011

Approved 09/13/2011

Page 4 of 6

---

- 9 Second story addition  
**#616 Petronia Street – Carlos Rojas (H11-01-791)**

**Postponed due to lack of quorum.**

- 10 Remodel two storefronts of existing noncontributing buildings and repaint.  
**#211A-211B Duval Street – L & M Associates – Donald W. Laukka (H11-01-950)**

Commissioner Rojas recused himself due potential conflict of interest since he is also doing work at the site.

**Postponed due to lack of quorum.**

- 11 Extend parapet wall 20" up.  
**#111 Whitehead Street – One Call Construction (H11-01-960)**

David Pouliot presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report due to Enid Torregrosa recused herself due to personal reasons. Mr. Cunningham stated staff is in support of this item.

A motion was made by Mr. Rojas, seconded by Mr. Muench, that the Item be **Passed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Chairman Molinet, and Mr. Metzler

Yes: 3 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, and Mr. Rojas

- 12 Revisions to approved plans, installation of aluminum round top window on side elevation, installation of glass protection and vent for interior fireplace on back elevation.  
**#1030 Fleming Street – Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-980)**

**Staff approved.**

- 13 Installation of aluminum roof over mobile home.  
**#813 Galveston Lane – AMS Inc. (H11-01-989)**

**Postponed**

- 14 Construction of two interpretative display structures depicting the historic kitchen and slave living quarters that once were part of the Audubon House. Proposed location is in garden area of the property. The structure will be wood frame, unpainted, and for exhibit only.  
**#205 Whitehead Street – Richard J. Heisenbottle (H11-01-997)**

Richard J. Heisenbottle presented the project.

## **Public Comments:**

Lewis Wilson III spoke of his family's dedication and commitment to the Audubon House and their on-going involvement in this interpretative display project.

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

August 09, 2011

Approved 09/13/2011

Page 5 of 6

---

Commissioner Lopez spoke against the project stating that we do not need to manufacture history without complete facts just for the case of attracting tourists.

Katia Hechemma the historian for the Audubon House spoke of the extensive research that has taken place.

Vice Chairman Bryan Green called on Chief Building Official John Woodson for his comments. Mr. Woodson reminded everyone that is anything new is built on the property it will need to meet FEMA standards.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that they do not have Sanborn maps from the mid nineteenth century to determine if slave quarters did exist. She added that the kitchen is not proposed in the same location as the building stood on the Sanborn maps and full evidence would be needed to allow for construction of a slave quarters. Stating staff understands that the current documents are lacking in proof of an existing slave quarters on the property and there are not any documents showing anything other than the kitchen fireplace. The photos do not show where the proposed new structures were located on the property. Ms. Torregrosa stated based page 16 of The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for rehabilitation of Historic Buildings particularly Standard #3, staff understands that the project is inconsistent with the guidelines.

## **Standard 3**

***Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken. (Page 16)***

Commissioners discussed the application and alternatives.

A motion was made by Mr. Muench, seconded by Mr. Rojas that the Item be **Denied** based on Standard #3, page 16 of The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for rehabilitation Historic Buildings. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Chairman Molinet, and Mr. Metzler

Yes: 3 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, and Mr. Rojas

## **HARC Planner's Report**

### **15 Revisions to solar collector's guidelines**

Enid Torregrosa presented the new detailed Solar Collector's Guidelines, which were revised by the new Planning Director Don Craig.

An eMail from Jed Regante in support of the changes was read into the record.

A motion was made by Mr. Rojas, seconded by Mr. Muench, that the Item be **Approved**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Chairman Molinet, and Mr. Metzler

Yes: 3 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, and Mr. Rojas

**Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission**  
**August 09, 2011**  
**Approved 09/13/2011**

Page 6 of 6

---

**16 Demolition by neglect ordinances in other jurisdictions- staff research**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report and recommendations.

Commissioners discussed the documents presented and next actions.

Commissioners directed Ms. Torregrosa to move forward with drafting an ordinance.

**Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at **5:45 pm.**

**Submitted by,**  
**Jo Bennett**  
**Administrative Coordinator**  
**Planning Department**